

# **Meeting Minutes**Plan & Zoning Commission Meeting

Tuesday, July 2, 2019
Ankeny City Hall – City Council Chambers
410 W. First Street, Ankeny, Iowa

#### **CALL TO ORDER**

Vice Chair A.Renaud called the July 2, 2019 meeting of the Plan & Zoning Commission to order at 6:30 p.m.

#### ROLL CALL

Members present: L.Anderson, C.Ender, T.Flack, G.Hunter, A.Renaud, T.Ripper, and J.Woodcock. Absent: L.West. Staff present: E.Carstens, D.Gervais, D.Silverthorn, R.Hulstrom, K.Gorman, B.Fuglsang

#### AMENDMENTS TO THE AGENDA

T.Flack requested Item #2, 725 SE  $54^{th}$  Street – Panama Transfer Site Plan be removed from the Consent Agenda. Motion by G.Hunter to accept the July 2, 2019 agenda with the removal of Item #2 from the Consent Agenda. Second by T.Flack. All voted aye. Motion carried 7 - 0.

## COMMUNICATIONS

There were no communications.

#### CITIZEN'S REQUEST

There were no requests.

## **CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS**

## Item #1 Minutes

Motion to approve and accept the June 18, 2019 minutes of the Plan and Zoning Commission meeting.

#### Item #3. 914 NW Ash Drive - Resurrection Lutheran Church Site Plan Amendment

Motion to approve the site plan amendment and elevations for Resurrection Lutheran Church at 914 NW Ash Drive subject to City Council approval and recordation of a storm water management facility and maintenance covenant and permanent easement document.

Referencing Item #3, T.Flack commented the staff report states that the existing materials around the entire building are not permanent since there is a plan for an expansion in 2026. She questioned how the Commission should be handling these situations. Should the Commission be allowing non-permanent materials just because there is a plan for an expansion? G.Hunter shared that he did have some concerns with it but the Commission has approved other similar requests without a timeline for the addition. T.Flack stated that the Commission has approved similar requests but believes they were not public facing. G.Hunter commented that as the Commission moves forward, this is something that will need to be discussed during the ordinance rewrite. He further said if the expansion does not take place how would we make sure their materials would be changed to meet the standards. E.Carstens shared that he does not believe there is a way legally to go back and enforce anyone to change their building materials.

Motion by L.Anderson to approve the recommendations for Consent Agenda Item(s) #1 and #3. Second by G.Hunter. All voted aye. Motion carried 7 – 0.

## **REMOVED CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS**

## Item #2. 725 SE 54th Street - Panama Transfer Site Plan

T.Flack shared that she is concerned that the building materials are not all permanent building materials and would like to hear more about the project from the developer.

Karl Chambers, Imprint Architects, 1605 N. Ankeny Boulevard, Ankeny stated the building was brought before the Commission about a month ago to receive input from the Commission on the building design. He stated that they have been working with City staff since that meeting. He shared on the office side; public facing they have incorporated split faced block and a 3-inch thick textured wall panel. He said from an appearance standpoint, it is in between a stucco and precast concrete look. T.Flack asked how that material holds up. Karl Chambers stated it is a lot more rigid then a metal panel. Karl Chambers also stated that this material would be 4-feet off the ground. He shared that the metal panel where the truck traffic would be is protected with truck dock bumpers. T.Flack then asked what type of material they would be using on the side of the building that faces the Gay Lea Wilson trail. Karl Chambers presented the site plan and elevations and explained that the west side of the building has a 4-feet concrete base with metal panel above. T.Flack



then asked if this site plan would meet the future zoning guidelines. D.Silverthorn stated he does not know if it meets the exact proposed percentages for the building materials but he did look at the proposed zoning guidelines and summarized how it would compare. E.Carstens stated the future design standards are not complete and continue to change during the update process. T.Flack shared that she would feel more comfortable approving a building with a majority of concrete, like in this case, then a foam-core type material. She further stated that she really does not have any real concerns with this development but wanted to understand if the materials are in-line with the direction of the new design standards. C.Ender shared that from his perspective the developer heard the Commission's comments, made the appropriate changes and would be comfortable approving the current design. L.Anderson concurred with C.Ender.

Motion by C.Ender to approve the site plan for 725 SE 54th Street, Panama Transfer, subject to City Council approval of the Panama Transfer Addition final plat; and City Council approval of the six-foot chain-link fence with barbed wire, as indicated on the site plan. Second by L.Anderson. All voted aye. Motion carried 7 - 0.

#### **PUBLIC HEARINGS**

There were no public hearings.

#### **BUSINESS ITEMS**

#### Item #4. 36 West Plat 4 Final Plat and Elevations

R.Hulstrom reported that 36 West Plat 4 is a replatting of 36 West Plat 3. She stated the proposed plat is an 11.56-acre townhome subdivision located south of NW 36th Street and east of NW Irvinedale Drive. The property is zoned R-3, restricted to 10 units per acre. R.Hulstrom said similar to the previous final plat, the proposed subdivision will contain 110 lots. She shared the developer is still proposing 109 attached townhome lots and a single lot for a community clubhouse. The general layout of the subdivision will remain the same. R.Hulstrom stated the primary purpose for the replatting is to provide new lot dimensions. She said 83 lots will be getting smaller while 26 lots will be getting slightly larger. R.Hulstrom explained that the new lot dimensions also include new elevations and the applicant is requesting that the new elevations supersede the previously approved ones. R.Hulstrom then presented the previously approved elevations for the townhomes and the clubhouse along with the new elevations for the townhomes and clubhouse. She stated that based on the memorandum received from the City Council encouraging City staff and the Plan & Zoning Commission to hold new developments to higher design standards, Staff believes that the proposed changes to the building elevations, specifically the townhomes elevations, are a step backwards in terms of unit variation and overall design.

G.Hunter, L.Anderson and T.Ripper commented that they completely agree with City staff regarding the building elevations. L.Anderson stated the clubhouse does not matter as much to him but definitely the townhomes. G.Hunter commented that he does not like the new townhomes or clubhouse elevations. He agrees that it is a step backwards. C.Ender stated he also agrees with staff, specifically on the townhomes as the previously approved elevations have varying garage doors and each individual unit appears to be its own unit due to the visual separation of units. He stated the new elevations look just like one large building. C.Ender then asked how many total buildings would be on this site. R.Hulstrom stated that they are proposing 19 buildings within the subdivision. C.Ender also stated that he is not in favor of the new clubhouse elevations as there is not a lot of architectural relief. C.Ender shared that there are some changes that could be made, which would not require major modifications such as varying up the garage doors and the siding style per unit. A.Renaud agreed that there are more architectural elements in the previously approved elevations.

Seth Moulton, 2874 NW 86<sup>th</sup> Place, Ankeny said he understands and appreciates the Commission's comments and he absolutely believes that they can make some exterior changes to the buildings to make them closer to the elevations that the Commission previously approved. He said the main reason for changes in the lot lines on the final plat is due to the change made to the different townhome floor plans. He shared that the townhome market has changed since they were in front of the Plan & Zoning Commission in 2018 and that is their reasoning for making the changes to the designs. Seth Moulton stated as it relates to the clubhouse, they originally used the design that they had used for their apartments and now feel that the design is not what they would like to use for a development such as this. He said this clubhouse is larger, has open areas and more gathering areas since they expect it to be a destination for this community. He stated they have increased their budget for the clubhouse and pool area and shared that they plan to start development once they get approval on the final plat. Seth Moulton said as to the architectural guidelines, he is open to revisions within reason.

G.Hunter and C.Ender both shared that they do not have any issue with the final plat, only the architectural elevations. C.Ender said what concerns him is that on the townhome units, the entire first floor is essentially garage doors and there is no architectural differentiation between units. He is looking for variety in the style of garage doors and the windows at the top. L.Anderson shared that he would like something done more with the entrances also. Seth Moulton stated with this design it will be a little more challenging but he believes that they could possibly add some dormers and architectural elements to help. C.Ender stated on the approved elevations, he likes the different siding materials per unit and asked if they would be able to add that to the new elevations. Seth Moulton commented that they would look at all their





recommendations and make some changes. As for the clubhouse, C.Ender commented that his biggest concern is the front elevation. G.Hunter prefers the clubhouse style in the previously approved elevations. Seth Moulton said they were going for a more prairie modern look due to some future home elevations for this neighborhood. He believes that they could possibly make some modifications to the clubhouse. E.Carstens shared with the Commission that the front of the clubhouse would not be highly visible from the public streets; it will only be visible when you are inside the complex. L.Anderson said that he would approve the clubhouse elevations as is, but he would not approve the elevations for the townhomes based on the variation of the units.

Seth Moulton stated that they could make architectural changes within a few days to make it look a lot more similar to what was previously approved. G.Hunter asked if staff would be comfortable with administratively approving a new set of elevations. E.Carstens responded that staff's preference would be that the Commission approve the elevations after the suggested changes are made. E.Carstens stated the elevations could be placed on the July 16, 2019 agenda.

Motion by G.Hunter to recommend City Council approval of the 36 West Plat 4 Final Plat. Second by L.Anderson. All voted aye. Motion carried 7 – 0.

Motion by C.Ender to table the proposed 36 West Plat 4 elevations until the July 16, 2019 Plan and Zoning meeting to provide the applicant time to amend the elevations. Second by L.Anderson. All voted aye. Motion carried 7 - 0.

## Item #5. Rose Marie Reinhart and Diamond Development LLC request to rezone property from R-1, One-Family Residence District to C-1, Neighborhood Retail Commercial District.

K.Gorman reported that Rose Marie Reinhart and Diamond Development LLC are requesting to rezone property from R-1, One-Family Residence District to C-1, Neighborhood Retail Commercial District. He stated that Rezoning Area C is located at the southeast corner of NW State Street and south of NW 36th Street and is comprised of 13.79 acres. He said the subject property is proposed to be rezoned to C-1, Neighborhood Retail Commercial District. K.Gorman explained that bordering this rezoning area is NW State Street to the west, NW 36th Street to the north, Prairie Ridge Church to the east, and R-3, Multiple-Family Residence District, restricted to 10 units an acre to the south. He shared that the proposed zoning change would not change the front yard, side yard, or rear yard setbacks that are required in the Neighborhood Retail Commercial District, and is consistent with the Ankeny 2040 Plan's Land Use Plan. He stated that the developer has submitted the required rezoning petitions. K.Gorman said the Plan and Zoning Commission held a public hearing for the proposed rezoning on June 18, 2019 and there were no comments from the public or Commission. Staff's recommendation is for the Plan and Zoning Commission to recommend City Council approval of the request by Rose Marie Reinhart and Diamond Development LLC to rezone property from R-1, One-Family Residence District to C-1 Neighborhood Retail Commercial District.

There were no comments from the applicant or representative. There were no questions from the Commission.

Motion by L.Anderson to recommend City Council approval of the request by Rose Marie Reinhart and Diamond Development LLC to rezone property from R-1, One-Family Residence District to C-1 Neighborhood Retail Commercial District. Second by T.Ripper. All voted ave. Motion carried 7 – 0.

## Item #6. Diamond Development LLC requests to rezone property from R-1, One-Family Residence District to R-3, Multiple-Family Residence District, with restrictions.

K.Gorman reported that Diamond Development, LLC is requesting to rezone property from R-1, One-Family Residence District to R-3, Multiple-Family Residence District with restrictions. He stated that Rezoning Area D is located north of NW 26<sup>th</sup> Street and west of NW Northpark Drive and is comprised of 12.07 acres. He said that they are proposing to rezone the property to R-3, Multiple-Family Residence District, restricted to one-family residential dwellings with minimum 70-foot lot widths. K.Gorman explained that the rezoning area is bordered by the Ashland Meadows Planned Unit Development to the south and R-2, One-Family and Two-Family Residence District, restricted to single-family Residence District, restricted to single-family to the east. He shared that the proposed zoning change would not change the minimum lot area, front yard, side yard, or rear yard setbacks that are required in the R-3, Multiple-Family Residence District, and is consistent with the Ankeny 2040 Plan's Land Use Plan. He stated that the developer has submitted the required rezoning petitions. K.Gorman said the Plan and Zoning Commission held a public hearing for the proposed rezoning on June 18, 2019 and there were some comments from the public, mostly clarifying and confirming that only single-family homes could be constructed within this rezoning area. Staff's recommendation is for the Plan and Zoning Commission to recommend City Council approval of the request by Diamond Development LLC to rezone property from R-1, One-Family Residence District to R-3, Multiple-Family Residence District, with restrictions.

C.Ender asked if there would need to be a new preliminary plat if the property changes from R-1 to R-3. K.Gorman responded that a preliminary plat is more like a sketch plan in the code. If the developer still meets the intent of the





preliminary plat, which in this case is bigger lots with single-family detached structures on each lot, they would not need a new preliminary plat. K.Gorman then explained the rezoning history associated with this property. C.Ender asked what the setback difference is between an R-1 and R-3 zoning district. E.Carstens stated there is a 5-foot difference. C.Ender asked if this rezoning would allow them to remain consistent with the rest of the development for front yard setbacks. K.Gorman said yes.

There were no comments from the applicant or representative.

Motion by G.Hunter to recommend City Council approval of the request by Diamond Development LLC to rezone property from R-1, One-Family Residence District to R-3, Multiple-Family Residence District, with restrictions. Second by T.Flack. All voted aye. Motion carried 7-0.

## Item 7. JDEV, LLC requests to rezone property from R-3, Multiple-Family Residence District, with restrictions to R-3, Multiple-Family Residence District, with restrictions

D.Silverthorn reported that the applicant, JDEV, LLC, is requesting to rezone property from R-3, Multiple-Family Residence District, with restrictions to R-3, Multiple-Family Residence District, with restrictions. He stated the subject property is approximately 1.65 acres located east of US HWY 69/NE 14<sup>th</sup> Street, and approximately a quarter-mile north of the intersection at NE 54<sup>th</sup> Street. He shared that the properties to the north are zoned R-3, Multiple-Family Residence District, restricted to 10 units/acre and the properties to the east and south are zoned R-3, Multiple-Family Residence District, restricted to single-family. D.Silverthorn stated there are two specified areas within this proposed 1.65-acre rezoning. Rezoning Boundary "A," which includes a 1.62-acre portion of land to be rezoned from R-3, restricted to 10 units/acre and Rezoning Boundary "B," which includes a 0.03-acre portion of land to be rezoned from R-3, restricted to 10 units/acre to R-3, restricted to single family. The Plan and Zoning Commission held a public hearing for the proposed rezoning on June 18, 2019 and there were no questions or comments from the public. Staff recommends that the Plan and Zoning Commission recommend City Council approval of the request by JDEV, LLC to rezone property from R-3, Multiple-Family Residence District, with restrictions to R-3, Multiple-Family Residence District, with restrictions.

C.Ender asked what the benefit is to rezone this property. D.Silverthorn explained that they originally submitted a preliminary plat with the original Cougar Valley Farms Rezoning. He stated they have removed 8-single family lots to make it part of the multi-family area and the .03 acres is to assist in lining the street up with NE Oak Drive. C.Ender commented that in his opinion, there should be a second access with this plat and maybe this additional frontage will allow an area for a second access to the south.

There were no comments from the applicant or representative.

Motion by T.Flack to recommend City Council approval of the request by JDEV, LLC to rezone property from R-3, Multiple-Family Residence District, with restrictions; to R-3, Multiple-Family Residence District, with restrictions. Second by L.Anderson. All voted age. Motion carried 7 - 0.

## **REPORTS**

## **City Council Meeting**

T.Flack reported on her attendance at the July 1, 2019, City Council meeting.

## **Director's Report**

E.Carstens presented the tentative agenda items for the July 16, 2019 Plan and Zoning Commission meeting and the June 2019 Building Permit Report.

## Commissioner's Reports

G.Hunter shared that the right in / right-out on NE 18th Street across from The Fletcher is not working.

## **MISCELLANEOUS ITEMS**

July 15, 2019 - 5:30 p.m. City Council Meeting Representative: Staff

## **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 7:25 p.m.

Jugsang

Submitted by Brenda Fuglsang, Secretary

Plan & Zoning Commission